



**HISTORIC DISTRICT
REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting**

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

5:30 pm

**City Council Chambers
2nd Floor of City Hall**



**HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting Agenda
November 19, 2024
5:30 pm
at City Hall, Council Chambers**

Roll Call

Paemon Aramjoo, Linda Armstrong, John Carr, Kathy Chelton, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Matt Grundy, Brett Rinker, Katie Schmidt

- I. Call to Order
- II. Approval of Meeting Summary from the November 4, 2024 HDRC meeting
- III. Current Business
 - HDRC Case #24-028J Consideration of an After the Fact Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of seven wood windows replaced with seven vinyl windows at 417 E. Mississippi, Jewell Historic District.
- IV. Administrative Approvals since the November 4, 2024 meeting:
 - a. 320 W Kansas like in kind gutters and roof
 - b. 407 N. Lightburne like in kind roof
- V. Other Business:

Miscellaneous matters from the Commission:

Miscellaneous matters from Staff:
- VI. Adjournment

LIBERTY HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting Summary
November 4, 2024 at 5:30 pm
City Council Chambers

Roll Call: Paemon Aramjoo, Linda Armstrong, John Carr, Kathy Chelton, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Matt Grundy, Brett Rinker, Katie Schmidt

Present: Linda Armstrong, Kathy Chelton, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Matt Grundy, Brett Rinker, Katie Schmidt

Absent: Paemon Aramjoo, John Carr

Six members of the public were present

Staff Present: Jeanine Thill, Community Development Manager

Chairman Grundy called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Approval of Meeting Summary October 15, 2024: A motion to approve the meeting summary, as corrected was made by Commissioner Armstrong. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gray. The motion passed 7-0-0.

Current Business

HDRC Case #24-013D Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for back-porch steps, like in kind repairs to wood rot and adding a door on the accessory structure at 14 N. Prairie, Dougherty Historic District, a 353 project.

- Staff read the staff report and recommended approval.
- Commissioner Drottz asked what material they plan to use on the boards around the windows.
- The applicant said she hopes to use the existing materials and do repairs, but if replacement is necessary, it would be wood. The stairs will also be wood.
- Commissioner Drottz said he would recommend a product called *Abitron* for any repairs.
- The applicant said she would like recommendations on how to preserve the garage siding.
- Commissioner Drottz recommended using a wood hardener, then apply a clear protection then paint it if so desired.
- Commissioner Rinker asked if there would be a railing for the back steps. The applicant said there will not.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rinker to approve the application as presented because it meets the guidelines and the UDO. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Drottz. The motion passed 7-0-0.

HDRC Case #24-018LS Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an ADA ramp and railing, tuckpointing, re-glazing one window, like in kind repairs and replacement of the rear decking and railings at 24 S. Main, Liberty Square Historic District, a 353 project.

- The staff report was read and staff is recommending approval.
- Commissioner Gray commented that they will likely need a bottom rail on the ADA ramp.
- The applicant clarified that on the ramp on the rear of the building, they will be using horizontal cables with 4 inches in between. It maintains the original look, as you can't see the cables from a distance. The roof cap will be aluminum. They plan to keep the roof caps and replace it like in kind if needed.

A motion was made by Commissioner Drottz to approve the application as presented because it meets the design standards and the UDO. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Chelton. The motion passed 7-0-0.

HDRC Case#24-014D Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs and replacement after storm damage, rebuild the front porch, replace siding and windows at 405 W. Franklin, Dougherty Historic District.

- The staff report was read and staff is recommending approval. The home and front porch will be rebuilt to look as it did before the storm damage.
- Commissioner Rinker said if there is something they can't do in kind, he would encourage them to call staff to get approval on site if needed.
- The applicant clarified that there will be new Marvin wood windows; three on the front and one the west side as well as the two dormer windows.

A motion was made by Commissioner Drottz to approve the application as amended, because it meets the Design Standards and the UDO. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Armstrong. The motion passed 7-0-0. Passed.

Other Business

Administrative Approvals since the October 15, 2024 meeting:

- 438 E. Franklin like in kind front steps and handrails

Miscellaneous matters from the Commission:

- Commissioner Rinker said there are some homes in district that appear to have gutters that need repairs. Staff said that the nuisance code be used to address failing gutters.
- The house on Lincoln was sent a letter for the front yard fence.
- Staff will continue to send a packet with the Design Guidelines book to new home owners in the local historic district.

Miscellaneous matters from Staff:

- Please send staff any trainings you have attended to meet the CLG requirement.

We will have a meeting on Tuesday Nov 19 Please RSVP at your earliest convenience.

The meeting adjourned at 6:07 pm.



HDRC Case No. 24-028J

Staff: Jeanine Thill, Community Development Manager

HDRC Meeting Date: November 19, 2024

GENERAL INFORMATION

Application: After the Fact Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of 7 wood windows replaced with 7 vinyl windows.

Applicant: Jackie Griffith

Location: 417 E. Mississippi

District: Jewell

NRHP Status/category: Contributing

File Date: November 1, 2024

SPECIFIC INFORMATION

SITE HISTORY

This 1927 Colonial Revival home is similar to 321 and 403 N. Lightburne with the gambrel roof and overall massing. Gable porch entry, north or main façade. Fenestration is double-hung, sash-type with simple wooden surrounds. Open porch with wood supports, west elevation. Brick chimney, side right.

PROPOSAL DESCRIPTION

- The applicant replaced seven wood windows and replaced them with vinyl windows.
- Five windows were replaced on the on the rear/ south elevation and two on the west elevation with Alside Mezzo vinyl replacement windows <https://www.alside.com/product-catalog/vinyl-replacement-windows/>

ANALYSIS

Unified Development Ordinance (“UDO”) - The Unified Development Ordinance outlines design principles that have been adopted for all historic districts and landmarks in the City of Liberty.

Design Guidelines (“DG”) - Design Guidelines were established to give the HDRC general guidance in making subjective preservation choices in accordance with accepted best practices and the Secretary of the Interior standards for historic preservation.

DG: Sec. 30-72. District HP, design principles.

Staff Analysis

7. Doors and windows: Original doors and windows shall not be replaced unless there is substantial evidence that they are no longer serviceable or cannot be restored. Restoration of original entryways that may have been covered, altered, or removed over time is encouraged. Replacement doors and windows that imitate an earlier inappropriate style are discouraged. In general, existing openings shall not be covered or relocated. If additional entryways or service doors become necessary, they shall be located and designed in a sensitive manner. If it is necessary to expand original openings, it shall be accomplished in a manner that respects and complements the surrounding building elements, materials, and colors.

DG Page 27: Whereas vinyl is a modern petroleum product rather than a natural construction material, it is inappropriate for use within the Historic Preservation Overlay Zoning District.

4. Windows that are not original to the structure and not historic may be replaced in-kind or with a higher grade material. In-kind replacements consistent with this standard shall be approved by staff. Non-original windows that are not historic may be replaced with new windows that match the existing windows in shape, size, operation, muntin pattern, profiles, and detailing. The window material must be the same or superior to that of the existing windows, as determined by the HDRC and prescribed in the table of Appropriate Replacement Windows.

It is not clear if the wood windows that were removed were original to the home nor if they could be restored.

It appears that the original window size and openings have been maintained and the original style of windows, 3 over 1 were installed.

The replacement of the wood windows with vinyl windows is not appropriate.

PREVIOUS CASES / ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

19-011J Application for a deck on the rear the home was submitted and withdrawn in September of 2019.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The application does not meet the standards for review and guidelines; therefor staff recommends denial of HDRC case #24-028J

ATTACHMENTS

1. Exhibit A: Vicinity Map
2. Exhibit B: Inventory Data Sheet
3. Exhibit C: Existing Conditions
4. Exhibit D: Manufacturers Information & Window Replacement Table





HDRC Case #24-028J
417 E Mississippi



EXHIBIT A:
VICINITY MAP

MISSOURI OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

ARCHITECTURAL/HISTORIC INVENTORY SURVEY FORM

<p>1. NO. Roll c #11</p> <p>2. COUNTY Clay</p> <p>LOCATION OF NEGATIVES Liberty City Hall-Comm. Dev.</p>	<p>4. PRESENT LOCAL NAME(S) OR DESIGNATION(S) 417 Mississippi</p> <p>5. OTHER NAME(S)</p>	<p>1. NO. Roll C #11</p> <p>2. COUNTY Clay</p> <p>4. PRESENT LOCAL NAME(S) OR DESIGNATION(S) 417 Mississippi</p> <p>6. TOWNSHIP</p> <p>RANGE</p> <p>SECTION</p>
<p>6. SPECIFIC LEGAL LOCATION TOWNSHIP _____ RANGE _____ SECTION _____ IF CITY OR TOWN, STREET ADDRESS</p>	<p>16. THEMATIC CATEGORY Architecture</p> <p>17. DATE(S) OR PERIOD c. 1927</p> <p>18. STYLE OR DESIGN Colonial Revival</p> <p>19. ARCHITECT OR ENGINEER unknown</p> <p>20. CONTRACTOR OR BUILDER unknown</p> <p>21. ORIGINAL USE, IF APPARENT residence</p> <p>22. PRESENT USE residence</p> <p>23. OWNERSHIP PUBLIC () PRIVATE (X)</p> <p>24. OWNER'S NAME AND ADDRESS IF KNOWN Paul and Harriet Smock</p> <p>25. OPEN TO PUBLIC? YES () NO (X)</p> <p>26. LOCAL CONTACT PERSON OR ORGANIZATION Liberty, MO; Community Develop.</p> <p>27. OTHER SURVEYS IN WHICH INCLUDED</p>	<p>28. NO. OF STORIES 2</p> <p>29. BASEMENT? YES (X) NO ()</p> <p>30. FOUNDATION MATERIAL concrete</p> <p>31. WALL CONSTRUCTION frame</p> <p>32. ROOF TYPE AND MATERIAL New England gambrel asphalt shingle</p> <p>33. NO. OF BAYS FRONT 3 SIDE 2</p> <p>34. WALL TREATMENT stucco</p> <p>35. PLAN SHAPE rectangular</p> <p>36. CHANGES (EXPLAIN IN NO. 42) ADDITION () ALTERED () MOVED () none</p> <p>37. CONDITION INTERIOR unknown EXTERIOR good</p> <p>38. PRESERVATION UNDERWAY? YES () NO (X)</p> <p>39. ENDANGERED? BY WHAT? YES () NO (X)</p> <p>40. VISIBLE FROM PUBLIC ROAD? YES (X) NO ()</p> <p>41. DISTANCE FROM AND FRONTAGE ON ROAD 15' Mississippi</p>
<p>7. CITY OR TOWN IF RURAL, VICINITY Liberty, Missouri</p> <p>8. DESCRIPTION OF LOCATION <i>Lightburne</i> <i>Mississippi</i></p> <p>9. COORDINATES UTM LAT _____ LONG _____</p> <p>10. SITE () BUILDING (X) STRUCTURE () OBJECT ()</p> <p>11. ON NATIONAL REGISTER? YES () NO (X)</p> <p>12. IS IT ELIGIBLE? YES () NO (X)</p> <p>13. PART OF ESTAB. HIST. DISTRICT? YES () NO (X)</p> <p>14. DISTRICT POTENTIAL? YES () NO ()</p> <p>15. NAME OF ESTABLISHED DISTRICT</p>	<p>42. FURTHER DESCRIPTION OF IMPORTANT FEATURES Similar to 321 and 403 N. Lightburn with the gambrel roof and overall massing. Gable porch entry, north or main façade. Fenestration double-hung, sash-type with simple wooden surrounds. Open porch with wood supports, west elevation. Brick chimney, side right.</p>	<p>5. OTHER NAME(S)</p> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;">PHOTO MUST BE PROVIDED</p>
<p>43. HISTORY AND SIGNIFICANCE See 321 N. Lightburn</p>	<p>44. DESCRIPTION OF ENVIRONMENT AND OUTBUILDINGS Alley to east. Located in a neighborhood consisting of late 19th and early 20th century housing stock.</p>	
<p>SOURCES OF INFORMATION water permit # 7-1260 4/26/27 Mrs. Myrtly Bruner</p>	<p>46. PREPARED BY C. Millstein/P. Glenn</p> <p>47. ORGANIZATION Liberty-Community Dev.</p> <p>48. DATE SPR. 86</p> <p>49. REVISION DATE(S)</p>	
<p>RETURN THIS FORM WHEN COMPLETED TO: OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION P.O. BOX 176 JEFFERSON CITY, MISSOURI 65102 PH 314-751-4096</p>		<p>SECTION Exhibit B</p>





Exhibit C: Existing Conditions

Products

- Siding
- Windows & Patio Doors
- Metals
- Decorative Accents

Home > Products > Windows & Patio Doors > Vinyl Replacement Windows > Mezzo® Energy-Efficient Vinyl Windows

Mezzo® Energy-Efficient Vinyl Windows



Historic District Design Guidelines
Window Replacement Table

Updated 4/2011

Existing Material	Acceptable Replacement Materials								
	Wood	Aluminum-clad wood	Composite	Fiberglass	Aluminum	Vinyl-clad wood	Vinyl	Steel	Other materials not listed
Original wood or historic non-original wood	<i>Replacement not allowed unless approved by the HDRC</i>								
Wood	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✗	✗	Will be reviewed by the HDRC as requested
Aluminum-clad wood	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✗	✗	
Composite	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✗	✗	
Fiberglass	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✗	✗	
Aluminum	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✗	
Vinyl-clad wood	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✓	✗	✗	
Vinyl	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✓	✗	
Steel	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✗	✗	✓	

✓ = acceptable ✗ = not acceptable

Exhibit D:
Replacement Windows
& Window Replacement
Table.