

LIBERTY HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting Summary
March 19, 2024
5:30 pm
City Council Chambers

Roll Call: Paemon Aramjoo, Linda Armstrong, John Carr, Kathy Chelton, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Matt Grundy, Brett Rinker, Katie Schmidt

Present: Paemon Aramjoo, Linda Armstrong, John Carr, Kathy Chelton, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Matt Grundy, Brett Rinker

Absent: Katie Schmidt

Applicants: Benn Garrett, owner of 418 E. Mississippi, Jeremy Walters, owner of 2 E. Franklin.

Staff Present: Katherine Sharp, Director Planning & Development, Jeanine Thill, Community Development Manager

Chairman Grundy called the meeting to order at 5:30 pm.

Approval of Meeting Summary: March 5, 2024 HDRC Meeting Summary

A motion to approve the meeting summary as corrected was made by Commissioner Aramjoo. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Chelton. The motion passed 8-0-0.

Current Business:

HDRC Case # 24-003J Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for a front yard rock retaining wall at 418 E. Mississippi, Jewell Historic District

- Ms. Thill presented the staff report.
- Chairman Grundy asked if the applicant had anything to add.
- Mr. Garrett said that the wall will help with the runoff onto the sidewalk, it gets very muddy.
- Commissioner Gray thanked the applicant for using real stone for the wall, adding that she feels this is a great proposal.
- Vice Chair Carr commented that he agrees the stone wall is appropriate and complements the stone on the home and is only 18 inches tall.
- Commissioner Rinker said that he was a bit surprised that he started digging before the application was approved.
- Commissioner Armstrong said that it will be nice to have sidewalks without mud on them. This will fix that.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rinker to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Chelton. The motion passed 8-0-0.

HDRC Case # 24-004LS Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for new windows, doors, roof and like in kind wood rot repairs at 2 East Franklin Street, Liberty Square Historic District, a 353 Tax Abatement project.

- Ms. Thill presented the staff report.
- Chairman Grundy asked if the applicant had anything to add.
- Mr. Walters said that their goal is to keep the historic character and to make the building fully usable, including the second floor and not change the look. On the Pella reserve the grills are applied.
- Commissioner Drottz said that the proposed Pella Reserve windows are very nice windows, adding that the grills are applied and they are closest thing they could find that is historically accurate. He added that he is good with everything in the application except that he thinks the proposed four panel door on the West elevation should match the others on that elevation and on the front door too.
- Commissioner Gray said she would recommend that solid upper door on the west elevation match the others, so they all look the same.
- Mr. Walters said he is agreeable to use whatever doors look the best.
- Vice Chairman Carr said the entrance door should be an outswing seven-foot door. He doesn't have a problem with replacing the doors.
- Vice Chairman Carr said the building is 156 years old and one of the oldest buildings on the square. In his exterior observation, on the first-floor west side one of the windows appears to be in good shape and the glazing is in good shape, the other windows need priming and glazing and painted.
- Vice Chairman Carr said he thinks the building is worthy of having the windows repaired and restored. The moisture has degraded the paint. He added that once the paint is all scraped off and epoxy is used, they are in good shape. However, he added that he can't make a professional assessment without being on site.
- Mr. Walters said there is a lot of wood rot.
- Vice Chairman Carr added that the replacement windows are excellent windows.
- Commissioner Gray commented that the replacement windows do have a few extra lines that are different from the original windows.
- Commissioner Gray said she doesn't have a problem replacing the windows. She added that the windows may not be appropriate for state historic tax credits, as the shadow line is slightly different than the original windows.
- Ms. Thill added that the applicant indicated they are applying for a National Trust sub grant for the project. The applicant might want to check with the sub-grant requirements to make sure the new windows meet their standards.
- Commissioner Armstrong asked about the front door and what would be appropriate.
- Commissioner Gray said the divided lites wouldn't be appropriate for the front door, it looks residential. She would recommend a full view front door or a door that looks like those on the west.
- They may need to ask for clarification on out swinging. Pella does a commercial door with a single lite. Residential doors don't meet ADA. The threshold needs to be ADA.
- Drottz said full lite would be best. Or $\frac{3}{4}$ lite without the panel below.

- Mr. Walters said that he has the original pediments that were once on the front second story façade of the south elevation.
- The commission agreed that it would be appropriate to put them back on the building and encouraged the applicant to refinished and reinstall them.

A motion was made by Commissioner Armajoo to approve the application as presented but with a full lite front door or one to match the new west side doors. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gray. The motion passed 7-1-0. Vice Chair Carr voted for denial.

Miscellaneous Matters from the Commission:

- Commissioner Chelton said she attended the City Council meeting regarding the vote on the demolition of 11 N. Water. She commented that a City Councilmember said that the motion by HDRC with the stipulation was an illegal motion.
- Chairman Grundy said it was illegal, in that it can't be stipulated on a different act. He encouraged the Commissioners to watch the City Council meeting.

Administrative Approvals

- 416 Miller Ave. Like in kind replacement of the stairs and railings
- 34 S. Main Sign

Miscellaneous matters from the Commission:

- Vice Chairman Carr said that he is disappointed that the Commission couldn't see that the windows at 2 E. Franklin can be restored.

Miscellaneous matters from Staff:

- The owners of 38 S. Terrace have not responded to three notices that the alterations to the garage door are not appropriate and that they need to apply for a COA. A citation letter has been sent.
- A letter was sent to 455 Miller regarding the deck that was built without permits
- A letter will be sent to the owner of the Neal Ray building on the square that has paper in the windows and appears to be neglected.
- Commissioner Gray said it is her understanding that there are no utilities in that building and that the owner chose not to connect to the new main sewer line.

The meeting adjourned at 6:20 pm.