

LIBERTY HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting Summary
June 6, 2023
5:30 pm
City Council Chambers

Roll Call: Paemon Aramjoo, Linda Armstrong, John Carr, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Matt Grundy, Brett Rinker, Katie Schmidt

Present: Paemon Aramjoo, Linda Armstrong, John Carr, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Brett Rinker, Katie Schmidt

Absent: Matt Grundy, Kathy Chelton

Applicants: Jose Orozo, 10 S Terrace; Reed Oshel, 36 Moss; Carly Rylie, 436 W Franklin;

Staff Present: Katherine Sharp, Director of Planning & Development; Jeanine Thill, Community Development Manager

Vice Chairman Carr called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m.

Approval of Meeting Summary: February 21, 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Aramjoo to approve the February 21, 2023 meeting summary as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schmidt. The motion passed 7-0-0.

Approval of the Design Sub Committee Meeting Summary: May 19, 2023

A motion was made by Commissioner Drottz to approve the Design subcommittee summary from May 19, 2023. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Aramjoo. The motion Passed 7-0-0.

Current Business

HDRC Case #23-003PH Consideration of three new windows at 10 S. Terrace Ave., Prospect Heights Historic District.

Discussion: Mr. Orozo commented that the existing windows are vinyl replacement windows from the 1970's. Commissioner Rinker asked if there is a difference going from double hung to single hung. Vice Chairman Carr said the single hung will look the same, the only difference is the upper sash is stationary. Commissioner Gray asked if the proposed Andersen 100 series Fibrex windows have been approved in the past. Staff confirmed they have been approved in the past. Commissioner Armstrong commented it would be nice to see a sketch of the footprint of the home, showing where these windows are on the home.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rinker to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Aramjoo. The motion passed 7-0-0.

HDRC Case#23-004PH Consideration of replacement of two retaining walls in the front yard at 36 Moss, Prospect Heights Historic district.

Discussion: Commissioner Gray asked the applicant what are they are planning to put in the one-foot setback area between the sidewalk and the new retaining wall. Mr. Oshel said they would likely put rock there. Staff said they would check with Public Works to see if gravel is allowed in the right of way.

Mr. Oshel said the height of the new wall will the same as the original wall. It will stair step down. He wants to keep the width of the side walls going up the stairs the same as well.

Vice Chairman Carr said he appreciates the photo-shop image of the new wall. He commented that they look nearly two feet wide and asked for clarification. Mr. Oshel said that it is not to scale, he is trying to duplicate what was there before. He added that the salvaged stone could be reused, he plans to reuse it for landscaping. The wall at Morse and Franklin has a similar wall, he said if others would like to use some stone to repair their wall, that could be a possibility. Commissioner Schmidt said she would be happy to contact those property owners and make them aware that stone may be available.

A motion was made by Commissioner Armstrong to approve the application as presented with the dimensions of the walls as described in the packet, not as shown in the photo-shopped image. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Aramjoo. The motion passed 7-0-0.

HDRC Case #23-003D Consideration of a new garage at 428 W Franklin, Dougherty Historic District.

Vice Chairman Carr said he would like to commend the architect on the style of the garage, it complements the home very well.

Commissioner Armstrong commented she appreciates the attention to detail.

Commissioner Gray asked if there is a loft space above the garage. Ms. Rylie said it is just raised, no loft space.

Commissioner Rinker asked if the textured siding was appropriate. Vice Chairman Carr said that he feels that the textured siding is appropriate because it is an accessory structure not on the home itself. Commissioner Gray suggested that they should consider the smooth siding, because it looks more authentic in her opinion. After discussion, it was determined that smooth or textured siding would be appropriate.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gray to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Aramjoo. The motion passed 7-0-0.

HDRC Case#23-005J Consideration of After the Fact alterations to the West side porch at 462 E Kansas, Jewell Historic District.

Commissioner Aramjoo commented that the roof over the west porch that was removed appeared to be in poor shape. Vice Chairman Carr agreed and added that the roof and posts were not original to the home.

Commissioner Carr commented that the skirt boards are needed because the newel posts are overhanging the porch.

Commissioner Armstrong said it needs to be in the record what material will be used to cover the cinderblock used to raise the garage and home. The Commission would like to see what product they are planning to use.

Ms. Sharp asked if it would make more sense to continue the siding down to grade level rather than covering the cinderblock with the proposed stone or brick. She asked if the Commission had a recommendation of material that would be appropriate. Vice Chairman Carr recommended a stucco finish, so the stone isn't in front of the siding.

The Commission agreed that the west porch skirt needs to be put in with a minimum of a 2x. They agreed that the porch skirt needs to be 2x's with a width to cover the rim joist and at a minimum, it should be flush.

A motion was made by Commissioner Armstrong to approve the application for the west porch with the following amendments:

1. The image of the proposed materials be included in the record as part of the application;
2. The skirt board application be placed so that the newel posts are flush or inset from the rim of the porch; and
3. Below the skirt board should be either horizontal and vertical lattice or diagonal lattice. The horizontal 1x's are not appropriate.

The application meets the design guidelines and the materials are compatible with the other elements of the house. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Aramjoo. The motion passed 6-0-1. Commissioner Gray recused herself.

Ms. Sharp was asked to explain the difference between a porch and a deck. She said that porches contain elements such as columns, balusters, and finish details that correspond with the design and detailing on the rest of the house. Porches are typically skirted, painted, and generally under roof (although the non-historic roof was removed from this porch). She said a deck is typically made of natural or composite lumber, and is stained versus painted. The west porch will be painted and have porch features.

Other Business

Administrative Approvals since the February 21, 2023 meeting:

- 233 W Kansas Like in kind replacement of concrete front porch 2023-001D
- 449 Miller Fence in rear yard 2023-004J
- 312 W Kansas Like in kind repairs / replacement of front porch railing and flooring 2023-004D
- 253 W Kansas Like in kind repairs to wood rot on the home and garage, replacement of the full view storm door and removal of non-historic materials.

Miscellaneous matters from the Commission:

Vice Chairman Carr said that Kathy Chelton was not able to attend tonight's meeting but wanted to share that at 462 E Kansas the third-floor newel posts don't line up with the second-floor posts. Commissioner Rinker said he didn't notice it. Vice Chairman Carr said that because it isn't level and plumb, they probably won't line up. Commissioner Gray commented that it might look different because the rail is taller.

Vice Chairman Carr said he was under the impression last year that the alley by his home on Mill Street might be paved, but that hasn't been done. Ms. Thill said she asked Public Works about this and they said paving that alley is not a high priority.

Commissioner Rinker asked about the two dilapidated homes on Mississippi, just off of Morse across from Ruth Moore park. Ms. Sharp said they are going to court for nuisance violations.

Miscellaneous matters from Staff:

Ms. Thill reported that the owner of the three dilapidated homes on North Water will be sent a citation to appear in court due to the condition of the homes.

The meeting adjourned at 6:55 pm.