

**LIBERTY HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Summary**  
**November 2, 2021**  
**City Hall, Council Chambers**  
**5:30 p.m.**

Roll Call: John Carr, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Mike Gilmore, Matt Grundy, Dail Hobbs, Martha Reppert, Brett Rinker, Doug Wilson

Present: Matt Grundy, John Carr, Vern Drottz, Aimee Gray, Martha Reppert, Doug Wilson

Absent: Mike Gilmore, Dail Hobbs, Brett Rinker

Applicants Present: Diane Leader, A3G Architects representing 500 W. Franklin, and Sam Lodhi, owner of 239 N. Lightburne

Staff Present: Katherine Sharp, Director of Planning & Development, and Jeanine Thill, Community Development Manager

Chairman Grundy called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

**HDRC Case #21-021D Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition at 500 W. Franklin, Dougherty Historic District. A 353 Tax Abatement project.**

- Ms. Gray will recuse herself from voting on this case as the architect for the project. She said she would be happy to answer any questions.
- Vice Chairman Carr said he thinks this is a good application and a great addition to the home.
- Ms. Gray was asked if the existing siding is distressed. She said it was.
- She was asked if the outside miters will work with the existing exposures. Ms. Gray said she believes it will work, adding that she has watched several videos that showed it would work. They only come in 12" lengths. She said it would be better to have it mitered.
- Commissioner Drottz asked if they make the scalloped profile. She said they do not.
- Chairman Grundy said the mitered edge, rather than the boxed-out edge, would keep the profile.

A motion was made by Vice Chairman Carr to approve the application as presented because it meets the UDO and Design Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Drottz. The motion passed 6-1-0 with Commissioner Gray abstaining from the vote.

**HDRC Case #21-022J Consideration of an After-the-Fact Certificate of Appropriateness for new vinyl windows at 239 N. Lightburne, Jewell Historic District.**

- Mr. Lodhi said that this is a rental property and the renters were neglecting the property and he was having difficulty getting them out of the home, due to the Covid-19 non-eviction mandate.

- He is requesting that the Commission approves the vinyl windows. He commented that he can add grills or aluminum windows to make them look more ascetically pleasing. The windows that he removed were not original to the home and were leaking.
- Vice Chairman Carr said he appreciates his conciliatory approach. The guidelines specifically say that vinyl cannot be approved. He agrees with Staff that the Commission cannot approve this application.
- Commissioner Wilson said it's a neat house and it's a shame that he doesn't take care of it. It is in the historic district and the Commissioners are volunteers that serve to protect the district. The applicant is putting in junk windows and isn't even close to getting an approval, in his mind.
- Commissioner Gray asked if there were pictures of the windows before they were removed. Ms. Thill said there were some photos in the packet which were provided by the applicant of the non-historic windows.
- Chairman Grundy said vinyl windows are specifically prohibited, and the Commission couldn't approve them if they wanted.
- The applicant asked if the Commission can approve the size of the smaller window on the North side of the home, as it is a bathroom and the smaller window would allow for more privacy.
- Chairman Grundy said having the windows fit in the original opening is important. Curtains would be appropriate to provide privacy.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gray to **deny** the application as presented because it does not meet the UDO and Design Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wilson. The motion passed 6-0-0.

Commissioner Drottz suggested that we should send him types of windows that have been approved in the past. Staff will follow up with the applicant.

### **Approval of Meeting Summary: October 5, 2021 HDRC Meeting Summary**

A motion was made by Commissioner Reppert to approve the October 5, 2021 Meeting Summary as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wilson. The motion passed 6-0-0.

### **Other Business**

#### Preservation Plan Implementation – Priorities

- Ms. Thill said a copy of the Preservation Plan Implementation chapter was emailed to every Commissioner. She said we do not need to discuss in depth tonight, but asked that they be prepared to start discussing priorities at the upcoming meetings.
- Vice Chairman Carr said updating and tweaking guidelines should be a priority, in his opinion.
- Also, Vice Chairman Carr said we might want to specify that the new storm windows should be blind stop rather than overlap. A good example is at 400 E. Kansas, where overlaps were installed and they do not look good; that style goes to the edge of the frame. We should encourage blind stop rather than overlap. Adding that we may want to codify that so we can see the architectural trim. It is the difference between ordinary and extraordinary.

Administrative Approvals since the October 5, 2021 meeting:

- 430 E. Franklin - Like in-kind repairs to porch and gutters; HDRC Case #21-021J
- 327 Harrison Like in-kind storm windows HDRC Case 21-012PH

Miscellaneous matters from the Commission:

- None

Miscellaneous matters from Staff:

- We will have several agenda items on Nov. 16<sup>th</sup>, please let staff know if you are able to attend or not.

The meeting adjourned at 6:12 p.m.