

**LIBERTY HISTORIC DISTRICT REVIEW COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Summary**  
**May 18, 2021 at 4 pm**  
**Zoom Video Conference & 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Conference Room**  
**4:00 pm**

Present via Video Conference: Matt Grundy, John Carr, Dail Hobbs, Clay Lozier, Martha Ann Reppert, Brett Rinker, Doug Wilson

Absent: Mike Gilmore, Vern Drottz

Applicants Present via Zoom: Lloyd & Bunny Hartzler - 225 N. Lightburne; and Mark Buhlig - 226 N. Jewell

Staff Present: Jeanine Thill, Community Development Manager; and Katherine Sharp, Planning & Development Director/Moderator

Chairman Grundy called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

A motion was made by Commissioner Rinker to approve the May 4, 2021 meeting summary as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reppert. The motion passed 6-0-1. Chairman Grundy abstained as he was not present at the meeting.

**HDRC Case #21-010J Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations at 225 N. Lightburne, Jewell Historic District. A 353 Tax Abatement project.**

- Ms. Hartzler commented that if they are not allowed to move the window, they have no way to get a kitchen in the back of the home adding that they have to work around a chimney. By putting the kitchen in the SE area it connects well with the dining room.
- Chairman Grundy said the original window fenestration seems odd to him.
- Vice Chairman Carr complemented the Hartzlers on the progress already made on the home. He said he has no issues with moving the window and removing the small window. He suggested that the window be the same size as the other window to the north, left of the door so it keeps the harmony of the fenestration; by doing that, the top of the window will be at the same height as the other window on the same level. Vice Chairman Carr said he could give six to seven different examples of other window changes that were approved within the historic district in the past. He commented that they could use the old sash frame to match the window on the right. Mr. Hartzler said they would concur with that. This will keep the architectural features in harmony. Commissioners Rinker and Lozier said they agree with Carr. Commissioner Rinker asked what plans they have for the back of the home. Mr. Hartzler said they plan to put a deck on the back and hope to come back to HDRC with drawings at the June meeting.
- Staff said that because there isn't a proposed deck at this time, then a guard rail that meets code would need to be attached to the door jamb for safety.
- Chairman Grundy said he is comfortable with the application as submitted, adding that if there was a lot of symmetry to the existing windows, then he thinks he would feel differently.
- Commissioner Wilson commented that HDRC has denied changing original openings in the past. When we approve changes to windows we need to distinguish this case from others. Some of those reasons are: it is in the rear of the home and cannot be seen from the street, also the fact that the current configuration does not allow for the practical use

of the space without moving the windows. Those are distinguishing factors along with a lack of symmetry.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wilson to approve the application as submitted with the understanding that the small window on the east will be removed and the larger window will be shortened and moved 43 inches to the left. These modifications are being approved because of several factors including the fact that it is the rear of the home, the existing windows do not add architectural element to the house, and the existing layout does not allow for practical use of the interior of the home. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Rinker. The motion passed 7-0-0.

### **HDRC Case #21-004J AMENDED Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations at 226 N. Jewell, Jewell Historic District**

- Staff commented that she wanted clarification on if the siding would be smooth or textured. The applicant said what he could find was textured.
- Vice Chairman Carr said he would prefer that he use the smooth siding so it is in harmony with the existing siding. He added that the 1x4 flat stock might create an issue with the siding therefore he might want to consider using 5/4 stock or 1 inch nominal instead. Also, the short wall drawing to replace the railing is still showing batt and board siding. Mr. Buhlig said Smart Siding would be used.
- Vice Chairman Carr asked if there would be window sill extensions on the existing window frames. Mr. Buhlig said he would be happy to do sill extensions.
- Vice Chairman Carr commented that he likes the choice of the double hung window from Marvin as the bottom rail is very close to the style of the original window. Commissioner Rinker asked if it was a wood window. The applicant confirmed it is wood. Commissioner Rinker commented that he would prefer the smooth siding as opposed to the textured siding.

A motion was made by Vice Chairman Carr to approve the application as presented with the addition of sill extensions and a smooth finish siding because it meets the UDO and Design Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hobbs. The motion passed 7-0-0.

### **Other Business**

Administrative Approvals since the May 4, 2021 meeting: None

Miscellaneous matters from the Commission:

- Vice Chairman Carr said the short walls at 340 Harrison are too tall, it is framed too high. Staff will contact the owner and contractor.
- Vice Chairman Carr asked if we are looking at going back to in-person meetings. Staff said yes, on June 1<sup>st</sup>.
- Vice Chairman Carr asked if it is possible to asphalt another alley to help with water abatement. He would like the alley between Mill Street and E. Kansas Street paved. They get washed out on a regular basis. Staff will send an email to Bruce in Public Works.

- Vice Chairman Wilson would ask that we not allow homeowners to sit on a project any longer than necessary. We need to continue to be diligent with the problem houses. We need to not give up on the enforcement side. Vice Chairman Carr agreed with Wilson and we should give them a little push.

Miscellaneous matters from Staff:

- In person meetings start June 1<sup>st</sup>; if anyone would like a hybrid meeting, please notify staff.

The meeting adjourned at 4:50 pm.